

**Tweet Log**  
**CMLS Call: IDX PAG Report and Proposed Policy Changes**  
**10/31/11, 4:00 p.m. EST – 5:30 p.m. EST**

[myuntangledlife](#) Jacob Clayton

Beware [#realestate](#) consumers and agents, more decisions are being made regarding use of your data!

[julsp](#) julsp

[@councilofmls](#) Thanks so much for the great presentation. Great presenters. Really appreciate your efforts to bring this to us.

[REcaker](#) Berry Enloe

[@robhahn](#): Ira Luntz: "We have to define IDX rules to apply to all displays, not just websites" - (Yes! Please!)

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

Was great to see [@councilofmls](#) take a leadership role in reviewing the pending IDX policy changes before NAR.

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert

Thanks - for the forum!

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@sbonert](#) that is addressed in the new policy, thankfully :)

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert

One issue is amt of display space on mobile. RT [@robhahn](#): Ira Luntz: "define IDX rules to apply to all displays, not just websites"

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

Ira Luntz: "We have to define IDX rules to apply to all displays, not just websites"

[BLarsonMpls](#) Brian Larson

RT [@stevbyrd](#): - ... Who says Yahoo isn't social media? (who says [century21.com](#) isn't? If it is not, it soon will be.)

[hawaii](#) Ryan Ozawa

[@HawaiiRealty](#) [@amyjeddes](#) Also note RSS listing distribution vs. dynamic search results as [@MattCohen](#) demo'd. [@HilInformation](#) [#CMLS](#)

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

RT [@hawaii](#): [@HawaiiRealty](#) [@amyjeddes](#) Aloha! [@HilInformation](#) is on the - call as well. Agree RSS is a different animal versus display.

[hawaii](#) Ryan Ozawa

[@HawaiiRealty](#) [@amyjeddes](#) Aloha! [@HilInformation](#) is on the [#CMLS](#) - call as well. Agree RSS is a different animal versus display.

[@mwurzer](#) Currently, it takes a hack to scrape and repurpose. RSS makes it easy for any idiot to repurpose, and implies permission!

[Roverman](#) Rob Overman

[@stevbyrd](#) [@robhahn](#) [@jonathanjmabe](#) [@mcohenmn](#) [@REcaker](#) - I see Battle of the Blogs coming with IDX transport, licensing, enforcement

[stevbyrd](#) Steve Byrd

- The problem at its core, if you don't define "other sites", you're creating a free for all. Who says Yahoo isn't social media?

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer

www means open to the world and so web sites are no more controlled than RSS. Control comes down to the license terms. Period.

[stevbyrd](#) Steve Byrd

[@robhahn](#) [@Roverman](#) [@jonathanjmabe](#) [@mcohenmn](#) - Enforcement is the only issue. If it is not enforceable, it's a waste of effort.

[@bobbemis](#) so the MLS would have little role beyond offering the "dashboard"?

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

Question: "What is CMLS's working definition of "control", as in "controlled by the Participant"?"

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen

- Kill RSS. Social media - define it, define control and branding, limit to 'apps' that can meet compliance....

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@Roverman](#) [@jonathanjmabe](#) [@mcohenmn](#) of course, enforcement is still a big issue...

[amyjgeddes](#) Amy Geddes

Starting to make sense. RT [@robhahn](#): [@Roverman](#) [@jonathanjmabe](#) [@mcohenmn](#) and display would be closely tied to the license terms

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@Roverman](#) [@jonathanjmabe](#) [@mcohenmn](#) and display would be closely tied to the license terms

[@REcaker](#) in overly simplistic terms "transport" is how data is delivered and "display" is how it looks on the screen or paper

[AaronSOLD](#) Aaron Dickinson

Global opt-in/opt-out would be crazy since each syndicator can have wildly different sites.

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert

Some Curbed sites & some newspaper sites. I'll send links. RT [@mcohenmn](#): - Zillow doesn't resyndicate except to Yahoo. It "powers"..

[REcaker](#) Berry Enloe

[@robhahn](#): [@amyjgeddes](#) [@mwurzer](#) that's how i'm rollin' now -- remove transport altogether from IDX . (Define transport for me. ?)

[@mwurzer](#) - yes, we need tenable policy for each.

[AaronSOLD](#) Aaron Dickinson

The "best solution" for IDX franchisor syndication is the only way that makes sense. Treat them like any 3rd party.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer  
[@mcohenmn](#) But Matt, apps aren't web sites.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
[@amyjeddes](#) [@mwurzer](#) that's how i'm rollin' now -- remove transport altogether from IDX

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes  
[@mwurzer](#) do you think all forms of "transport" should be removed from policy and the focus be on "display"? starting to make sense.

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
-: Zillow does not re-syndicate except to Yahoo. It "powers"...

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
Under the "best solution", of site-by-site opt-out, how will the MLS deal with the inevitable anti-trust lawsuits?

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer  
A web site is HTML over HTTP, which combine as a transport. Is that really different than RSS?

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@amyjeddes](#): [@sbonert](#) - that gets to resyndication and need to us to get our arms around that!

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes  
[@sbonert](#) I think the speaker was referring to a "postlet" where it goes to Craigslist and Zillow.

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
RT [@Mlrealestate](#): [@mcohenmn](#) [@robhahn](#) Maybe scrap all IDX and start over? - [baby / bathwater]

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
[@sbonert](#) was a question from the audience

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert  
Did you hear who said that? RT [@robhahn](#): [@sbonert](#) you did just hear that, yes

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes  
Agree, it's transport. RT [@mwurzer](#): [@amyjeddes](#) But here's the difference, email updates are allowed under the policy. Why is that?

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn @  
[@sbonert](#) you did just hear that, yes

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert  
- Did I just hear that "zillow posts html to craigslist"? Not true, Zillow doesn't resyndicate anywhere except to Yahoo.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
A question from audience: "Should MLS do compliance over direct syndication by indiv. brokers?"

[Mlrealestate](#) Mike Bowler Sr  
[@mcohenmn](#) [@robhahn](#) Maybe scrap all IDX and start over?

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer  
[@amyjeddes](#) But here's the difference, email updates are allowed under the policy. Why is that?

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

On - call [@gregmanship](#) points out concerns with franchisor display change putting responsibility on MLS to syndicate to franchises.

[bobbemis](#) Bob Bemis

-broker opt-in/out of syndication to franchisors MUST be on a destination by destination basis.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@mwurzer](#) [@amyjeddes](#) and I'd like to see that analysis applied to "search engines"

[bobbemis](#) Bob Bemis

-all or none broker syndication network doesn't work. As soon as one broker asks for exception you have to rebuild the system.

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

[@mwurzer](#) don't disagree - I think the whole point is that the policy is becoming difficult to manage compliance in meaningful way.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer

[@amyjeddes](#) I would like to see the chain of custody analysis applied to email updates.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@mlsjimharrison](#) now going into display being controlled by participants; this is the absolute key to the whole business

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen

[@robhahn](#) Gee, I think Jim and I are in agreement!

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

Should there be rules ? RT [@mwurzer](#): An RSS feed of listings can be restricted by license and targeted to particular users.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

Short Version of [@mlsjimharrison](#)'s preso: Don't Approve RSS IDX! - I'm convinced.

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

Interesting concept of "chain of custody" of MLS data by [@mlsjimharrison](#) - essentially no control or recourse on display.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer

An RSS feed of listings can be restricted by license and targeted to particular users.

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen

[@mwurzer](#) - antiscraping a whole other kettle of fish that I'd love to get into.

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

49 minutes into - call and the first mention of a consumer. To MLS orgs the Broker is their consumer and they provide him/her data.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer

[@mcohenmn](#) - Think about how many email updates are sent today versus RSS feeds and I'd suggest email is a far larger problem.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@mcohenmn](#) [@mwurzer](#) seems to me that new IDX Policy, read broadly, is all about display; would be simpler to separate transport

[councilofmls](#) CMLS- Council of MLS  
[@gregmanship](#) & [@mlsjimharrison](#) presenting The Challenges now

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes  
Both [@gregmanship](#) and [@mlsjimharrison](#) on - call reviewing the implications of the policy - especially compliance and monitoring.

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@robhahn](#) [@mwurzer](#) - that's the conclusion of some but not the PAG proposal as written.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
[@mwurzer](#) [@mcohenmn](#) isn't the whole conclusion to deal with transport issues separately from the display issues of IDX?

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@mwurzer](#) - RSS authentication precludes most common uses

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@mwurzer](#) - the inconsistency concerns me.

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@mwurzer](#) - - oh yes, I've been brought in to deal with scraping. IDX anti-scraping has been 'as needed' vs. VOW mandated.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn  
[@bobbemis](#) it's a good start, but the language reads differently than that definition. Lawyers would have a field day.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer  
[@mcohenmn](#) and how many IDX sites do you think have anti-scraping today or over the last 5 years? Has scraping been rampant?

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@mwurzer](#) - - I don't think so - again, that's specific browsable content for a specific individual. Where to draw the line? Tricky.

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer  
[@mcohenmn](#) What if the address, price, beds, baths, etc are in the email? Would that be disallowed?

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@mwurzer](#) - I had to take out my anti-scraping slides for time limitation

[bobbemis](#) Bob Bemis  
-"Control?" try this - "the ability to comply with this policy and applicable MLS rules." End of second paragraph of proposed policy

[councilofmls](#) CMLS- Council of MLS  
John Rees Esq giving the lowdown on The Interpretation (potential areas of risk).

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen  
[@robhahn](#) - fiduciary - good question!

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen

[@mwurzer](#) - email was not put as 'data' cf. rss. If going to website, other anti-scraping can be implemented. -

[julsp](#) julsp

RT: [@bobbemis](#) - - I agree with Matt, RSS and other transport mechanisms should not be part of IDX display policy. Thanks Matt. Make...

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@mcohenmn](#) Related question for John: "What is the fiduciary duty of a NAR Director to study this issue before voting in Anaheim?"

[mwurzer](#) Michael Wurzer

[@mcohenmn](#) What prevents a bad hat from subscribing to email updates and scraping the links?

[mcohenmn](#) Matt Cohen

I thought my slides were scary - John Rees Esq slides should REALLY make folks proposing IDX changes quake.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

Question for John Rees: "What are the likely damages in case of litigation around these risks?"

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

RT [@bobbemis](#): - - I agree with Matt, RSS and other transport mechanisms should not be part of IDX policy. Thanks Matt. Makes sense.

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

CMLS attorney pointing out legal areas of IDX PAG recommendations to be aware of and potential risks to mitigate.

[bobbemis](#) Bob Bemis

- - I agree with Matt, RSS and other transport mechanisms should not be part of IDX display policy. Thanks Matt. Makes sense.

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@amyjeddes](#) perhaps; I just assume that words have meaning. I'm curious to hear what ppl think of the new "control" language

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

On - call [@mcohenmn](#) explaining how RSS is somewhat like RETS (a transport) but doesn't require ANY authentication.

[BLarsonMpls](#) Brian Larson

[@robhahn](#) Manhattan is only part of NYC without MLS

[robhahn](#) Robert Hahn

[@mcohenmn](#) confirms: "new IDX policy is a broad announcement of principle".

[sbonert](#) Sara Bonert

RT [@councilofmls](#): watch hashtag - for what's going happening on the webinar right now

[amyjeddes](#) Amy Geddes

Transport vs. display of IDX data will become key when discussing interpretation of the IDX policy with social media tools.